Pre-service music teachers’ satisfaction with the teacher education curriculum in northern China

Lin Fang†, Chiew Hwa Poon‡, Ku Wing Cheong†, Ku Wing Cheong†, Ku Wing Cheong†

*Department of Music, Faculty of Creative Arts, University of Malaya, 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.
†Email: 1178588053@qq.com
‡Email: chiewhwa.poon@um.edu.my
§Email: cheongkw@ucsiuniversity.edu.my

ABSTRACT

Pre-service music teachers’ satisfaction with the curriculum has implications for student learning and curriculum development. It is necessary to investigate pre-service music teachers’ satisfaction with the curriculum to help universities respond to changing social needs. However, there is lack of empirical studies on this topic in China. This study aims to explore the degree of satisfaction of pre-service music teachers in northern China with the curriculum to reveal the current challenges and issues in music teacher education. For this, a quantitative statistical method was adopted to conduct a questionnaire survey among 421 pre-service music teachers who major in music education in four different universities in northern China. The satisfaction survey regarding curriculum content and curriculum design was conducted to identify challenges and issues in the current music teacher education curriculum. The results show that pre-service music teachers are moderately satisfied with the curriculum. The findings indicate the following: 1. Teaching methods are monotonous; 2. There is some ambiguity concerning teaching objectives and training standards; 3. Practical courses and practice mentors need to improve; and 4. Pre-service music teachers lack confidence in the preparation for teaching in the future. Universities can significantly contribute to improving curriculum satisfaction and students’ confidence in teaching preparation by actively providing teaching-related knowledge, skills, policies and goals. Universities should consider the learning needs of pre-service music teachers and improve traditional teacher-centered teaching methods to improve teaching quality.

Contribution/Originality: This research contributes to the area of teachers’ education, especially regarding the learning needs of pre-service music teachers. The originality of the study lies in its investigation of the current situation of music teacher education from the students’ perspective in northern China. It provides practical recommendations to improve music teacher education.

1. INTRODUCTION

In recent years, universities have increasingly begun to use student satisfaction as a proxy for educational quality indicators and strategic goals (Langan & Harris, 2019; Nassar, Heinze, Jasimuddin, & Procter, 2022; Winstone, Ajjawi, Dirkx, & Boud, 2022). Students are key stakeholders of universities, and their satisfaction with the educational services provided by universities directly affects future student enrolment (Guilbault, 2018), academic achievement (Mihanović, Batinić, & Pavličić, 2016), student retention (Calma & Dickson-Deane, 2020),...
and universities’ economic sustainability (Silva & Fernandez, 2012). Therefore, higher education systems have an obligation to meet stakeholders’ needs related to acquiring knowledge, skills and job competencies (Peck, 2020). The field of pre-service music teacher education (PMTE) is no exception. Many studies related to the satisfaction of pre-service music teachers (PMTs) concentrate on the relationship between individual differences and learning satisfaction (Cevik, 2011; Cevik, Perkmen, Alkan, & Shelley, 2013), such as the role of their values in their level of job satisfaction (Perkmen, Cevik, & Alkan, 2012) and the influence of shyness on academic satisfaction and academic achievement (Oguz-Duran & Demirbatir, 2020). However, PMTs’ satisfaction with the PMTE curriculum has not yet been investigated. The curriculum is the key structure of higher education institutions (Annala, Lindén, & Mäkinen, 2016), so it is necessary to investigate PMTs’ satisfaction with the curriculum to help universities make it more responsive to changing social needs.

This study uses Dewey (1916) and Shulman’s pedagogical content knowledge (PCK) as theoretical guidance to investigate PMTs’ satisfaction with the curriculum. The purpose is to explore the current issues and challenges of PMTE in northern China. One current challenge in PMTE is preparing teachers for future challenges, which is worthy of investigation and discussion (Schwille, Dembélé, & Schubert, 2007). Music teacher preparation should continually adjust programs to increase the effectiveness of teacher candidate preparation (Fisher, Summitt, Koziel, & Hall, 2021). Hence, this study addresses the following research questions:

1. What is the level of satisfaction of PMTs with the curriculum content of PMTE?
2. What is the level of satisfaction of PMTs with the curriculum design of PMTE?

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

It is generally known that pre-service is the first stage of a teacher’s career cycle and development, which is referred to as training and preparing for a specific teaching role (Fessler, 1985). Pre-service teacher education programmes play a critical role in developing future teachers as an essential part of the learning–teaching continuum (Darling-Hammond, 2017; Flores, 2016). Accordingly, PMTE programmes aim to improve the quality and capabilities of teacher candidates (Schwille et al., 2007). Similarly, in China, normal music education programmes are offered as music education majors in universities that aim to cultivate music teachers for elementary and secondary schools.

2.1. Pre-Service Music Teacher Education Curriculum

PMTE is an educational process to help PMTs gain music skills and pedagogical and cognitive knowledge for their future teaching careers. The process is carried out through a planned curriculum that focuses on developing PMTs’ music education knowledge and skills. A curriculum consists of four main elements: Content, instructional strategies, assessment, and evaluation (Prideaux, 2003). Phenix (1962) pointed out that all curriculum content should be drawn from the disciplines. The distinguishing mark of a discipline is that its knowledge is instructive and particularly suitable for teaching and learning (Phenix, 1962). Temmerman (1997) stated that it is significant to investigate whether a curriculum’s content is essential and sufficient to prepare effective music teachers. Music is a unique subject that requires music teachers to have performance skills, subject knowledge and pedagogical knowledge. Therefore, the curriculum should provide sufficient courses on musical skills, teaching competence and relevant beliefs.

A curriculum’s structure consists of subjects, courses, unit plans and lesson plans. The most critical curriculum domains are its development and design (Ornstein & Hunkins, 2018). Curriculum design is defined as a learner’s educational experience within an educational programme that aims to help them understand theoretical and research frameworks, sustainable professional practice, and societal needs (Parkay, Anctil, & Hass, 2014). A curriculum design should incorporate a syllabus that addresses goals, practice and theory, teacher skills, supervision and assessment, the environment, principles, and student needs (Macalister & Nation, 2020). This article
investigates PMTs’ satisfaction with the design of their curriculum mainly in terms of standards and goals, supervision, teacher skills, practice and theory.

PMTE in China is a four-year undergraduate programme. The curriculum content includes teaching courses, general courses, music subject knowledge courses and practice courses. The content for teaching music subject knowledge includes music theory and ear training, polyphony, harmony, music form and analysis, instrument performance, folk music, Chinese and Western music history, impromptu accompaniment, chorus and conducting, and music appreciation (Ministry of Education, 2004). The content that focuses on helping PMTs acquire teaching knowledge includes general pedagogy, music pedagogy method and design, and educational psychology (Ministry of Education, 2004). The curriculum also includes practice courses, such as social, educational and performance practice (Ministry of Education, 2004). In this article, the emphasis is on professional music education courses, including compulsory and elective courses.

2.2. Curriculum Satisfaction

It is well known that cultivating quality teacher candidates requires an effective curriculum. In order to ensure a curriculum’s effectiveness, it is necessary to evaluate and assess faculty and departmental curriculum implementation (Elliott & Healy, 2001). Curriculum effectiveness can be assessed using direct measures, including comprehensive exams and projects, and indirect measures, such as student satisfaction with the curriculum (Jamelske, 2009; Tessema, Ready, & Yu, 2012). Thus, surveying student satisfaction in an academic setting is extremely important not only to assess the effectiveness of the educational process (Billups, 2008; Zhang, Wang, Min, Chen, & Huang, 2016) but also to identify less satisfied students to support them in completing their academic objectives (Rossini, Bulfone, Vellone, & Alvaro, 2021). Therefore, exploring PMTs’ satisfaction is critical to ascertaining whether universities are fulfilling their obligations.

Soliciting PMT satisfaction with the curriculum is effective in improving the quality of university teaching and curriculum development. Research indicates that satisfied people are willing to put in more effort than dissatisfied people (Bryant, 2006; Rossini et al., 2021). Therefore, PMTs who are satisfied with the curriculum will put more effort into their education by being more active in terms of both the curriculum and practice. Higher education institutions provide academic services that must meet the learning needs of students, including access to knowledge and skills that will help their future careers (Nassar et al., 2022). Moreover, academic factors such as teaching quality, skills, knowledge and courses are crucial determinants of overall student satisfaction (Gibson, 2010; Munteanu, Ceohanu, Bobálča, & Anton, 2010; Poon, 2019). Sebastianelli, Swift, and Tamimi (2015) found that course content, clarity and design were important factors in perceived learning and satisfaction. The most critical quality dimensions affecting curriculum satisfaction are the reliability of the teacher’s delivery method and the teacher’s ability and empathy (Jereb, Jerebic, & Uhr, 2018; Stodnick & Rogers, 2008). Smith, Grealish, and Henderson (2018) mentioned that when curriculum satisfaction is evaluated to guide decision-making regarding pedagogic and curriculum design, students should be surveyed to determine how they value the knowledge they have learnt, how they have learnt, and what additional information they have received.

2.3. Course Experience Questionnaire

The course experience questionnaire (CEQ) is a reliable evaluation scale used to measure students’ satisfaction with the course and the teaching, and students’ self-evaluation skills (Ramsden, 1991). The CEQ has mainly been used in Western countries (Grace, Weaven, Bodey, Ross, & Weaven, 2012). However, there is growing interest in examining undergraduate student satisfaction with teaching quality in China (Yin, Wang, & Han, 2016), Malaysia (Thien & Jamil, 2020), and India (Kaur, Singh, & Garg, 2022). The CEQ is implemented to achieve two main objectives: 1. Maintain assurance and accountability by providing higher education institutions with a mechanism to analyze student ratings and develop performance indicators for quality teaching (Griffin, Coates, Mcinnis, & James, © 2021 Conscientia Beam. All Rights Reserved.
2. Help higher education institutions develop more complete processes to improve the level of teaching quality using the comparative results of the CEQ (Griffin et al., 2003). In order to answer the research questions, three scales from the CEQ were used in this study: Good teaching, clear goals and standards, and overall satisfaction.

2.4. Underpinning Theories

Dewey (1916) proposed that the main teaching principle is learning by doing, and teaching should start from the experience and activities of students. Teaching requires specific expertise and pedagogical knowledge. Pedagogic content knowledge (PCK) is a framework appropriate to teacher education that instructs teachers how to combine knowledge and skills (Shulman, 1987). Shulman (1987) divided teachers' knowledge structures into seven categories as follows: 1. Content knowledge, 2. General pedagogical knowledge, 3. Curriculum knowledge, 4. Pedagogical content knowledge, 5. Knowledge of learners and their characteristics, 6. Knowledge of educational situations, and 7. Knowledge of educational ends, purposes, and values (p.8). Using PCK in the PMTE curriculum can help PMTs prepare more effectively. The PCK model used by Shulman (1986) includes content knowledge, which is a teacher's core knowledge in a specific content area; pedagogical knowledge, which refers to specific knowledge about teaching and how a teacher demonstrates pedagogical expertise; and curricular knowledge, which reflects a teacher's understanding of the curriculum framework and objective and the content, methods and evaluation of the subject. The fact that PCK helps music teachers convey subject matter to students in diverse contexts is a critical factor in determining how to educate future teachers (Forrester, 2018). PMTs need to develop PCK for their future careers as music teachers.

Previous studies have assessed PMT satisfaction from multiple academic and non-academic perspectives, including students as consumers (Budd, 2017; Calma & Dickson-Deane, 2020), the personality self-perceptions of PMTs (Cevik, 2011), service quality (Darawong & Sandmaung, 2019; Zhu & Sharp, 2022), and PMTs’ job satisfaction (Perkmen et al., 2012), demonstrating that satisfaction can inform the quality of teaching and the curriculum in higher education. Huang, Wang, Tseng, and Wang (2011) suggested investigating the practical knowledge of individual academic courses, as well as the necessary professional knowledge and skills to help graduates to smoothly enter the professional field and minimize discomfort. Meanwhile, teacher educators need to carefully consider what professional characteristics and abilities new teachers should possess to ensure that universities can provide effective music courses and provide future generations with the best teacher education programs (Temmerman, 1997). Curriculum designers and teachers should have the ability to listen to the students’ voices and participate in evaluating students’ reactions to their classroom practices (Stavrou & O’Connell, 2022). Schmidt (1989) proposed that in order to make wise decisions about curriculum reform, it is necessary to continue systematic research and project evaluation in music teacher training. However, there is still a limited body of research on PMTs’ satisfaction with the teacher education curriculum in China. The purpose of this study is to explore the current issues in PMTE in northern China through investigating PMTs’ satisfaction level with the curriculum content and design. The curriculum content comprises professional music education course subjects, including compulsory and elective courses. Curriculum design includes the standards and goals, supervision, teacher skills and practice.

3. METHOD

This study employed a quantitative statistical method research design. An online questionnaire survey was conducted to investigate how satisfied PMTs at normal universities are with the curriculum. A questionnaire is the most common quantitative method used to collect data in social research (Johnson & Christensen, 2014). Researchers can gain information about participants’ opinions, attitudes, beliefs, cognitions, personalities and behavioral intentions through questionnaires.

© 2024 Conscientia Beam. All Rights Reserved.
3.1. Participants

The participants were music (teacher) education undergraduates (years 3–4) from four normal universities in northern China, including Hebei, Beijing and Tianjin. The names of the universities cannot be revealed due to privacy concerns for the university and the participants. Since accessible lists of the entire population are not available in China, convenience sampling (a non-probability sampling method) was chosen for this study (Lonner & Berry, 1986). A total of 435 questionnaires were returned. Invalid questionnaires (those that had missing values or took less than three minutes to complete) were eliminated, leaving 421 valid questionnaires after screening, giving a 96.8% recovery rate. The number of valid samples is more than five times the total number of questionnaire items (Nunnally & Bernstein, 1994). Table 1 describes the demographic characteristics of the participants.

Table 1. Descriptive statistics of demographic variables.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Valid percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>33.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>66.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University level</td>
<td>Junior</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>45.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senior</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>54.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental major</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>26.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vocal</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>50.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dance</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Keyboard</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Instrument</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>17.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 1, 142 males (33.7%) and 279 females (66.3%) participated. The fact that there were more females than males is in line with the gender distribution characteristics of this major, so the sampling is reasonable. There were 190 juniors (45.1%) and 231 seniors (54.9%). The grade ratio is also reasonable; there were 113 piano majors (26.8%), 213 vocal majors (50.6%), six dance majors (1.4%), one keyboard major (0.2%), 72 instrument majors (17.1%) and 16 with other types of major (3.8%). The vocal major had the greatest number of students, and the keyboard major had the least. This is consistent with the current distribution of music majors in universities in China.

3.2. Instrument

The instrument used in this study consisted of a statistically validated scale. Two experts were invited to review the questionnaire items and provide feedback. The participants’ responses were recorded on a 5-point Likert scale ranging from "strongly disagree" to "strongly agree", which is considered suitable for online questionnaires as it provides several choices and reflects individual objectivity (Joshi, Kale, Chandel, & Pal, 2015). The items used were inspired by the CEQ, Schulman’s PCK model, and Dewey’s educational thought. The areas covered are overall satisfaction, teaching quality, goals and standards, practical experience, preparation for teaching, and course content.

3.3. Data Collection Procedure

The researcher called university counsellors, gave them a detailed explanation of the study and requested their permission to send the questionnaire link to potential participants using the Sojump platform. The respondents participated voluntarily in the survey. On average, the PMTs took 15 minutes to finish the questionnaire.

3.4. Data Analysis Procedure

SPSS version 26.0 for Mac was used to analyze the data obtained from the participants. The variables of musical knowledge satisfaction and teacher education curriculum satisfaction used variable accumulation. The other
variables were measured using a 5-point Likert scale, the reliability and validity of which needed to be tested. The data was collected, invalid questionnaires were screened out, and then the validity was calculated.

### 3.5. Validity

This study adopted a structural validity test. Structural validity is divided into convergent validity and discriminant validity (Brown, 2015). It is necessary to complete the Kaiser–Meyer–Olkin (KMO) sample measure and Bartlett’s test. When the KMO value is greater than 0.7 and the Bartlett’s test’s significance value is less than 0.005, the data is reliable and valid. As shown in Table 2, the KMO value in this study is 0.860 > 0.7 and the Bartlett’s test’s significance value is less than 0.005, as determined using SPSS version 26.0 for Mac.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KMO measure of sampling adequacy</th>
<th>0.860</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett’s test of sphericity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approx. chi-square</td>
<td>15021.248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>df</td>
<td>703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4. RESULTS

The first research question concerned PMTs’ degree of satisfaction with the curriculum content. Participants were asked to assess how satisfied they were with their university’s performance in providing them with courses and experience. This part of the questionnaire covered overall satisfaction, music courses and content, and teacher education courses and content. Table 3 presents students’ overall satisfaction with their course experience.

#### 4.1. Overall Satisfaction

The overall satisfaction scale was used to assess PMTs’ overall satisfaction with the course and university experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall, I am satisfied with the quality of the university curriculum.</td>
<td>19 (4.5)</td>
<td>126 (29.9)</td>
<td>190 (45.1)</td>
<td>75 (17.8)</td>
<td>11 (2.6)</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall, I think that the college experience is valuable.</td>
<td>32 (7.6)</td>
<td>133 (31.6)</td>
<td>167 (39.7)</td>
<td>77 (18.3)</td>
<td>12 (2.9)</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total M = 3.19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

The majority of the PMTs (45.1%) slightly agreed that they were satisfied with the quality of the university curriculum (M = 3.16). In terms of the college experience being valuable, 39.7% slightly agreed and 31.6% agreed (M = 3.23). The mean score for the overall satisfaction scale came in at 3.19, indicating that PMTs felt that the education provided by their universities met the basic requirements but had room for improvement.

In this research, the scale was divided into a music courses section and a teacher education courses section. Table 4 presents the results pertaining to the skills and knowledge obtained through the music courses curriculum. Most of the PMTs affirmed that these courses provided them with valuable professional knowledge and skills (M = 3.64).
Table 4. PMTs' perceptions of their music courses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The music courses enhanced my performance skills.</td>
<td>95 (22.6)</td>
<td>141 (33.5)</td>
<td>124 (29.5)</td>
<td>52 (12.4)</td>
<td>9 (2.1)</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The music courses were helpful for my teaching preparation.</td>
<td>117 (27.8)</td>
<td>152 (36.1)</td>
<td>90 (21.4)</td>
<td>48 (11.4)</td>
<td>14 (3.3)</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The music knowledge was highly applicable to practical skills.</td>
<td>87 (20.7)</td>
<td>155 (36.8)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>64 (15.2)</td>
<td>13 (3.1)</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The music courses enhanced my teaching skills.</td>
<td>100 (23.8)</td>
<td>145 (34.4)</td>
<td>106 (25.2)</td>
<td>56 (13.3)</td>
<td>14 (3.3)</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The music courses improved my artistic understanding.</td>
<td>100 (23.8)</td>
<td>137 (32.5)</td>
<td>115 (27.3)</td>
<td>56 (13.3)</td>
<td>13 (3.1)</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>1.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As a result of my music courses, I feel confident about tackling unfamiliar problems.</td>
<td>106 (25.2)</td>
<td>150 (35.6)</td>
<td>100 (23.8)</td>
<td>50 (11.9)</td>
<td>15 (3.6)</td>
<td>3.67</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total M = 3.64</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

There were 152 PMTs (36.1%) who agreed that the music courses were helpful in preparing them for teaching practice (M = 3.74). The next highest rated item (M = 3.67) was the one expressing that the music courses gave PMTs the confidence to tackle unfamiliar problems. Identical mean scores were obtained for the items suggesting that the music courses enhanced PMTs’ performance skills (M = 3.62) and teaching skills (M = 3.62). Regarding whether the music courses improved PMTs’ artistic understanding (M = 3.61), 100 participants (23.8%) strongly agreed. The lowest mean score (M = 3.57) was obtained for the item related to the applicability of music knowledge to practical skills. Only 87 (20.7%) participants strongly agreed with this.

Figure 1 provides an overview of the PMTs’ level of satisfaction with the content of each music course in their universities. Performance includes performance skills and performing activities. Theory includes harmony, music form and analysis, polyphony and music theory. Minor includes vocal minor, dance minor and piano minor. Musicianship includes solfeggio, impromptu accompaniment, chorus, conducting, and music appreciation. History includes Chinese music history and Western music history.

![Figure 1. PMTs’ satisfaction with the content of their music courses.](image-url)

The PMTs were the most satisfied with the content of their music theory courses (M = 4.3), followed by their history courses (M = 4.1). The performance and musicianship courses obtained the same score (M = 4). The PMTs
were the least satisfied with the content of their minor courses (M = 3.9). Overall, the PMTs were highly satisfied with the content of their music courses (M = 4.06).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The educational theory content was practical.</td>
<td>161 (38.2)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>45 (10.7)</td>
<td>11 (2.6)</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teacher education courses were helpful in the preparation of my practice.</td>
<td>158 (37.5)</td>
<td>110 (26.1)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>43 (10.2)</td>
<td>8 (1.9)</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teacher education courses were highly applicable to practical skills.</td>
<td>147 (34.9)</td>
<td>115 (27.3)</td>
<td>97 (23.0)</td>
<td>42 (12.4)</td>
<td>10 (2.4)</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

Table 5 presents the results pertaining to PMTs’ satisfaction with the teacher education curriculum. The highest mean score (M = 3.74) was obtained for the item linking the teacher education courses to the development of classroom management abilities. The next highest mean score was achieved by the item stating that the educational theory content was practical (M = 3.69), with 119 (28.3%) strongly agreeing with this statement. More than half of the participants agreed or strongly agreed that the teacher education courses gave them the confidence to tackle unfamiliar problems (M = 3.66). A similar average score was obtained by the item expressing that the teacher education courses were highly applicable to practical skills (M = 3.65), with strong agreement from 116 participants (27.6%). More than 60% of the participants agreed or strongly agreed that the teacher education courses were helpful for PMTs’ teaching skills (M = 3.63). Finally, 54.4% agreed or strongly agreed that the teacher education courses were helpful in the preparation of practice (M = 3.58). Overall, the majority of the PMTs were satisfied with the content of their teacher education courses (M = 3.66).

Table 6 presents the results related to the PMTs’ level of satisfaction with the content of each of their teacher education courses – general pedagogy, music pedagogy method and design, and psychology. These courses focus on increasing PMTs’ teaching skills and pedagogical knowledge.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General pedagogy</td>
<td>161 (38.2)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>45 (10.7)</td>
<td>11 (2.6)</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music pedagogy method and design</td>
<td>158 (37.5)</td>
<td>110 (26.1)</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>43 (10.2)</td>
<td>8 (1.9)</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td>147 (34.9)</td>
<td>115 (27.3)</td>
<td>97 (23.0)</td>
<td>42 (12.4)</td>
<td>10 (2.4)</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

The highest mean score was recorded for the item related to music pedagogy method and design (M = 3.87), followed by general pedagogy (M = 3.85) and psychology (M = 3.8). Overall, most of the PMTs were satisfied with the content of their teacher education courses (M = 3.84).
The second research question concerned PMTs’ degree of satisfaction with the curriculum design, particularly in terms of the quality of teaching, the clarity of curriculum objectives, and the practical aspects.

4.2. Good Teaching

The six items shown in Table 7 focus on the PMTs’ evaluation of the teaching provided in their courses. In general, they were moderately satisfied with their teachers’ teaching behaviors (M = 3.21).

Table 7. PMTs’ perceptions of the teaching provided.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The lecturers made a real effort to understand the difficulties I might be having with my work.</td>
<td>38 (9.0)</td>
<td>104 (24.7)</td>
<td>151 (35.9)</td>
<td>106 (25.2)</td>
<td>22 (5.2)</td>
<td>3.07</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The lecturers worked hard to make their subjects interesting.</td>
<td>51 (12.1)</td>
<td>126 (29.9)</td>
<td>139 (33.0)</td>
<td>89 (21.1)</td>
<td>16 (3.8)</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teaching staff of this course motivated me to do my best work.</td>
<td>56 (13.3)</td>
<td>131 (31.1)</td>
<td>125 (29.7)</td>
<td>84 (20.0)</td>
<td>25 (5.9)</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>1.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The staff put a lot of time into commenting on my work.</td>
<td>49 (11.6)</td>
<td>135 (32.1)</td>
<td>128 (30.4)</td>
<td>90 (21.4)</td>
<td>19 (4.5)</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The lecturers were extremely good at explaining things.</td>
<td>50 (11.9)</td>
<td>121 (28.7)</td>
<td>146 (34.7)</td>
<td>78 (18.5)</td>
<td>26 (6.2)</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teaching staff normally gave me helpful feedback on how I was doing.</td>
<td>58 (13.8)</td>
<td>115 (27.3)</td>
<td>137 (32.5)</td>
<td>84 (20.0)</td>
<td>27 (6.4)</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total M = 3.21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: 5=Strongly agree, 4=Agree, 3=Slightly agree, 2=Disagree, 1=Strongly disagree.

The highest mean score was for the item stating that the lecturers motivated the PMTs to do their best (M = 3.26). Only 25.9% of the participants disagreed or strongly disagreed with this statement. The lowest mean score was obtained by the item stipulating that the lecturers tried their best to understand the difficulties that the PMTs may have had with their work (M = 3.07); a total of 128 PMTs (30.4%) disagreed or strongly disagreed with this declaration. The mean scores pertaining to lecturers’ efforts to make their subjects interesting and commenting on PMTs’ work (M = 3.25) were the same. More than 40% of the participants agreed or strongly agreed with the respective statements. The same mean score was obtained for the item describing the lecturers’ ability to explain (M = 3.22) and the item depicting lecturers’ tendency to give helpful feedback to PMTs (M = 3.22). Again, more than 40% of the participants agreed or strongly agreed with the respective statements.

4.3. Clear Goals and Standards

The items presented in Table 8 were used to evaluate course and teaching quality through determining how clear the curriculum goals and expectations were to the PMTs. Overall, the PMTs were relatively satisfied with the clarity of the goals and standards (M = 3.43).

The mean scores were the highest for the item declaring that the lecturers were always clear about their expectations of students (M = 3.48) and the item stipulating that the universities had clear standards in terms of music teacher training (M = 3.48). More than 52% of the PMTs agreed or strongly agreed with the respective statements. The item that obtained the lowest mean score was the one stating that it was easy for PMTs to know the standard of work that was expected from them (M = 3.34). While 107 participants (25.4%) disagreed or strongly disagreed with this statement, 47% agreed or strongly agreed with it.
Table 8. PMTs' perceptions of the clarity of the curriculum goals and standards.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It was always easy to know the standard of work expected.</td>
<td>72 (17.1)</td>
<td>126 (29.9)</td>
<td>116 (27.6)</td>
<td>86 (20.4)</td>
<td>21 (5.0)</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I usually had a clear idea of where I was going and what was expected of me in this curriculum.</td>
<td>92 (21.9)</td>
<td>128 (30.4)</td>
<td>101 (24.0)</td>
<td>77 (18.3)</td>
<td>23 (5.5)</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The staff made it clear right from the start what they expected from students.</td>
<td>90 (21.4)</td>
<td>132 (31.4)</td>
<td>109 (25.9)</td>
<td>68 (16.2)</td>
<td>22 (5.2)</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teaching goal was clear enough to understand.</td>
<td>91 (21.6)</td>
<td>114 (27.1)</td>
<td>114 (27.1)</td>
<td>71 (16.9)</td>
<td>31 (7.4)</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td>1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The correlation between the standards of university courses and social needs was clear.</td>
<td>102 (24.2)</td>
<td>123 (29.2)</td>
<td>87 (20.7)</td>
<td>80 (19.0)</td>
<td>29 (6.9)</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My university always had a clear standard of music teacher training.</td>
<td>96 (22.8)</td>
<td>125 (29.7)</td>
<td>105 (24.9)</td>
<td>73 (17.3)</td>
<td>22 (5.2)</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total M = 3.43</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

4.4. Practicum Experience

The items shown in Table 9 were used to examine the extent to which the PMTs felt that the theory of their courses was aligned with the practical component and whether that practicum experience improved their teaching ability rather than only their theoretical knowledge. On the whole, the PMTs were satisfied with the practicum experience, as indicated by the total median score for these items (M = 3.58).

Table 9. PMTs' perceptions of the practicum experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The teaching practicum arranged by the university was adequate.</td>
<td>101 (24.0)</td>
<td>123 (29.2)</td>
<td>128 (30.4)</td>
<td>52 (12.4)</td>
<td>17 (4.0)</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>1.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The practice courses paid attention to students' comprehensive qualities.</td>
<td>95 (22.6)</td>
<td>139 (33.0)</td>
<td>117 (27.8)</td>
<td>46 (10.9)</td>
<td>24 (5.7)</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The course content conformed to the university's practicum.</td>
<td>109 (25.9)</td>
<td>129 (30.6)</td>
<td>112 (26.6)</td>
<td>48 (11.4)</td>
<td>23 (5.5)</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participating in the practicum was helpful for my teaching skills.</td>
<td>109 (25.9)</td>
<td>128 (30.4)</td>
<td>104 (24.7)</td>
<td>54 (12.8)</td>
<td>26 (6.2)</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>1.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The intern mentors were supportive and responsible.</td>
<td>117 (27.8)</td>
<td>127 (30.2)</td>
<td>96 (22.8)</td>
<td>52 (12.4)</td>
<td>29 (6.9)</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The participation in class observation of elementary and secondary schools was essential to improve my teaching ability.</td>
<td>105 (24.9)</td>
<td>129 (30.6)</td>
<td>112 (26.6)</td>
<td>48 (11.4)</td>
<td>27 (6.4)</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total M = 3.58</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

The highest mean scores were obtained for the items focusing on the similarity between the course content and the practicum (M = 3.60) and the supportiveness and responsibility displayed by those who mentored the teaching interns (M = 3.60). More than 55% of the participants agreed or strongly agreed with the respective statements. The second highest mean scores were recorded for the item portraying the practicum as adequate (M = 3.57) and the item claiming that participating in the practicum was helpful for PMTs' teaching skills (M = 3.57). More than half of the PMTs agreed or strongly agreed with the respective statements. The item regarding participation in
class observations of elementary and secondary schools as essential in improving teaching ability and the item stating that the practice courses paid attention to students' comprehensive qualities achieved the same lowest mean score of \(M = 3.56\).

### 4.5. Preparation for Teaching

The items displayed in Table 10 were used to record the PMTs' evaluation of their preparation for their future teaching careers. In general, they were moderately satisfied with their preparation (\(M = 3.22\)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>5 n (%)</th>
<th>4 n (%)</th>
<th>3 n (%)</th>
<th>2 n (%)</th>
<th>1 n (%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My preparation in terms of actual classroom teaching was sufficient.</td>
<td>36 (8.6)</td>
<td>122 (29.0)</td>
<td>180 (42.8)</td>
<td>66 (15.7)</td>
<td>17 (4.0)</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The professional development plan was sustainable in terms of my future growth.</td>
<td>33 (7.8)</td>
<td>144 (34.2)</td>
<td>160 (38.0)</td>
<td>66 (15.7)</td>
<td>18 (4.3)</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There were professional knowledge gaps between my teaching preparation and actual teaching.</td>
<td>36 (8.6)</td>
<td>140 (33.3)</td>
<td>145 (34.4)</td>
<td>80 (19.0)</td>
<td>20 (4.8)</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was highly satisfied with the teaching quality of the undergraduate programme.</td>
<td>28 (6.7)</td>
<td>127 (30.2)</td>
<td>175 (41.6)</td>
<td>67 (15.9)</td>
<td>24 (5.7)</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The assessment of the level of course achievement demonstrated the achieved learning outcomes.</td>
<td>40 (9.5)</td>
<td>127 (30.2)</td>
<td>160 (38.0)</td>
<td>74 (17.6)</td>
<td>20 (4.8)</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The curriculum content was challenging.</td>
<td>37 (8.8)</td>
<td>131 (31.1)</td>
<td>167 (39.7)</td>
<td>68 (16.2)</td>
<td>18 (4.3)</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total M = 3.22</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Slightly agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree.

The highest mean score was obtained for the item pertaining to the sustainability of the professional development plan (\(M = 3.26\)), although 38% of the PMTs (\(n = 160\)) only slightly agreed with the relevant statement. The second highest mean score was achieved by the item stating that the curriculum content was challenging (\(M = 3.24\)). The item related to the teaching quality of the undergraduate programme received the lowest mean score (\(M = 3.16\)), with more than 40% of the PMTs (\(n = 175\)) only slightly agreeing with the presented statement. The PMTs expressed a moderate degree of satisfaction with the other three items (\(M = 3.22\)).

### 5. DISCUSSION

This study aimed to analyze the issues and challenges of PMTE in northern China from the perspective of PMTs' satisfaction with the curriculum. Although the PMT participants were generally satisfied with the curriculum content and curriculum design of their universities, half of the participants had ambiguous attitudes in this regard. The PMTs perceived a lack of correlation between university subject content knowledge and their future careers. This is consistent with previous research (Kourieos, 2019; Massolt & Borowski, 2020). The PMTs were confused about the expert knowledge and skills that teacher education programmes provide. These results have noteworthy implications that are explored below.

The PMTs appeared to be more satisfied with their music courses, which aligns with previous research. Hart (2019) stated that pre-service teachers generally place emphasis on music content knowledge rather than teaching-related knowledge. The assumption is that this is because of insufficient teaching experience in primary and secondary schools. PMTs might believe that the music curriculum can be more helpful for their performance and professional development. This could be a result of lecturers not clearly understanding the struggles that students encounter in the learning process and not working hard to make their subjects interesting. Thus, teachers should
improve their teaching methods, actively pay attention to students’ needs, and work to increase students’ interest in their courses (Yin et al., 2016). It is critical to raise PMTs’ awareness of the fact that music teachers need to have comprehensive teaching competence.

Moreover, the PMTs found the standards and goals of the curriculum difficult to grasp. Vague learning goals and expectations will obstruct PMTs’ learning. Georgii-Hemming and Westvall (2010) mentioned that many teachers ignore or misinterpret the goals of the curriculum or university plans, which limits their students' learning and professional development. Universities and lecturers should state clear standards to encourage students to direct and monitor their learning and should also encourage lecturers to collaborate with their colleagues to provide a cohesive learning experience (Allen, 2003). Furthermore, Dewey (1916) insisted that students must participate in the formulation of learning goals. Providing clear standards and goals of the curriculum will help PMTs prepare adequately for their future roles as teachers.

The PMTs also identified challenges related to the practicum experience, suggesting that mentor guidance was insufficient, and the experience did not prepare them adequately for classroom teaching. These results resemble those of a previous study, which found that pre-service teacher education lacks sufficient study modules and has gaps between theory and practice and insufficient links between universities and schools (Elstad, 2010; Flores, Santos, Fernandes, & Pereira, 2014; Kang, 2021). Participants in previous studies also highlighted a lack of mentor guidance for interns and a dearth of practice-related resources (Georgii-Hemming & Westvall, 2010; Kim, Raza, & Seidman, 2019). Universities need to adopt an appropriate model to improve the quality of internships and create a better link between experience and theory, thereby supporting student teachers’ expectations, needs and practice (Escalié, Chaliès, Legrain, & Moussay, 2023). Combining direct experience in actual music class teaching with the relevant theory can improve PMTs’ confidence and teaching competence (Al-Hassan, Al-Barakat, & Al-Hassan, 2012; Barton, 2015). It is also important to enhance the support that mentors provide PMTs during their field teaching. When PMTs experience successful teaching outcomes, their confidence and communication with their instructors, peers and in-service music teachers at their schools will improve. Thus, mentor teachers and universities should enhance the quality of the field experience and communicate with PMTs to understand their misgivings and support their professional development.

6. CONCLUSION

While the participants were satisfied with several aspects of the pre-service music teacher education (PMTE) curriculum, their responses emphasized that the following challenges and issues still need to be addressed: 1. Teaching methods are monotonous, and teaching content is insufficiently connected with actual PMT needs; 2. The objectives and standards of PMTE are unclear; 3. There are too few opportunities for PMTs to gain practical experience and observe and understand actual music classrooms, and the support provided by practice mentors needs to improve; 4. The preparation of future music teachers is currently insufficient, and there is a mismatch between PMTs’ expertise and that needed in the workplace. These issues and challenges are obstacles to the development of PMTE and affect the quality of the music teachers who emerge from these programmes.

Future studies should examine which theories and tools can be used to reduce PMTs’ learning and social crises and improve the quality of PMTE. As Kaur et al. (2022) noted, a life skills crisis occurs when there is a discrepancy between what students learn at university and what they learn at work. Schwille et al. (2007) stated that it is imperative that pre-service teachers who intend to become teachers undergo a well-structured preparation programme incorporating key values, principles and practices. Teacher education should be transparent rather than romanticized and should offer the teaching skills that prepare pre-service teachers to become teachers (Bergmark, Lundström, Manderstedt, & Palo, 2018). PMTE curricula and the associated goals and standards should also be open and transparent.
6.1. Implication

As a result of the study, it was found that the music teacher training process should promote the comprehensive development of musicianship and educatorship, rather than only focusing on the learning of professional knowledge and skills. PMTE should be integrated with social needs, school needs and student development. In particular, basic music education requires high-quality music teachers with key competencies. Therefore, it is necessary to train future teachers with music subject content knowledge, general pedagogical knowledge, curriculum knowledge and with clear standards and goals for teacher education. This will ensure the effectiveness of music teachers in schools and improve the quality of music education.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

As the main body of music teacher education, PMTs' perceptions and needs regarding the curriculum should be a focus in society and universities. Firstly, the lectures can improve traditional teaching methods to increase PMTs' interest in courses. In particular, increasing the opportunities and time for educational practice allows PMTs to realize that music teachers need comprehensive abilities including professional abilities and teaching abilities rather than just a certain performance skill. Secondly, universities and lecturers should provide a clear understanding of teacher training standards and goals to PMTs to support their preparation for future teaching. Finally, universities should improve the quality and quantity of practice mentors to ensure that PMTs receive adequate learning and guidance during their teaching practice. This will improve their teaching ability and professional development. Moreover, universities should prepare PMTs for future teaching within the context of the teacher professional development continuum. Future research on this topic could be based on the educational philosophy and experience continuum to further investigate PMTs' perception of teacher preparation and professional development.

8. LIMITATIONS

This study focused on PMTs' satisfaction with their current curriculum in an attempt to explore the challenges in PMTE from the perspective of PMTs. The participants were all PMTs studying in normal universities in northern China. Therefore, the results cannot necessarily be generalized to universities across China or in other countries. Future research should attempt to obtain more perspectives from a larger geographical area of China and from other countries. Furthermore, this study assessed student satisfaction rather than observed behavior, and this limitation should be addressed in future research. Despite these limitations, however, the results of the study can be used to help music educators and university decision makers to understand the current status of PMTE and to contribute to the future development of PMTE in China.

Funding: This study received no specific financial support.

Institutional Review Board Statement: The Ethical Committee of the University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia has granted approval for this study on 22 November 2021 (Ref. No. UM. TNC2 / UMREC_1633).

Transparency: The authors state that the manuscript is honest, truthful, and transparent, that no key aspects of the investigation have been omitted, and that any differences from the study as planned have been clarified. This study followed all writing ethics.

Competing Interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Authors' Contributions: All authors contributed equally to the conception and design of the study. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

REFERENCES


© 2014 Conscientia Beam. All Rights Reserved.


© 2021 Conscientia Beam. All Rights Reserved.


